	6 8 9 10 11 12	XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California SUSAN S. FIERING Supervising Deputy Attorney General DENNIS A. RAGEN, SBN 106468 MEGAN K. HEY, SBN 232345 Deputy Attorney General 300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6344 Fax: (213) 897-2802 E-mail: Megan.Hey@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for the People of the State of Californi TONY RACKAUCKAS District Attorney, County of Orange TRACY E. HUGHES, SBN 180484 Senior Deputy District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701 (714) 834-6504 (Additional Counsel are listed on the following page)	EXEMPT FROM FILING FEES PURSUANT TO GOV. CODE § 6103	
COPY	14	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
	15 16	FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA		
0	17	PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,	Case No. R G 18907841	
	18	·	COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL PENALTIES, INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND OTHER	
	19	Plaintiff,	EQUITABLE RELIEF	
	20	v.	(Health and Safety Code, §§ 25249.5 et seq.; Business and Professions Code,	
	21	NUTRACEUTICAL CORPORATION, a Delaware corporation; GRACELEIGH,	§§ 17200 et seq. and 17500 et seq.)	
	22	INC. (dba SAMMY'S MILK), a California corporation; and DOES 1-50, inclusive.	Verified answer required pursuant to C.C.P. § 446	
	23	Defendants.	440	
	24			
	25		•	
	26			
	27			
	28		1	

THE PEOPLE'S COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL PENALTIES, INJUNCTIVE AND OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF

1	Additional Counsel for the People (cont	CINUED FROM PRECEDING PAGE):
2		
	NANCY E. O'MALLEY	EDWARD S. BERBERIAN
3	District Attorney, County of Alameda	District Attorney, County of Marin
4	MATTHEW L. BELTRAMO, SBN 184796	ANDRES PEREZ, SBN 186219
4	Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
5	SHARA BELTRAMO, SBN 227246	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 145
5	Deputy District Attorney 1225 Fallon St., 9th Floor	San Rafael, CA 94903 Telephone: (415) 473-3072
6	Oakland, CA 94612	E-mail: aperez@marincounty.org
	Telephone: 510-383-8600	L man. aperez@marmeounty.org
7	E-mail: matt.beltramo@acgov.org	ALLISION HALEY
	shara.beltramo@acgov.org	District Attorney, County of Napa
8		KATY YOUNT SBN 279550
0	DEAN D. FLIPPO	Deputy District Attorney
9	District Attorney, County of Monterey	PATRICK COLLINS, SBN 253872
10	Amy Anderson, SBN 301732	Deputy District Attorney
10	Deputy District Attorney	1127 First Street, Suite C
11	CHRISTOPHER JUDGE, SBN 274418 Deputy District Attorney	Napa, CA 94559 Telephone: (707) 299-1452
	1200 Aguajito Road, Room 301,	E-mail: katy.yount@countyofnapa.org
12	Monterey, CA 93940	patrick.collins@countyofnapa.org
	Telephone: (831) 647-7770	1 7 1 8
13	E-mail: andersona@co.monterey.ca.us	STEPHANIE BRIDGET
1.4	judgec@co.monterey.ca.us	District Attorney, County of Shasta
14	Inventory Dogray	Anand "Lucky" Jesrani, SBN 238252
15	JEFFREY ROSEN District Attorney County of Sente Clare	Senior Deputy District Attorney
13	District Attorney, County of Santa Clara YEN DANG, SBN 169388	1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
16	Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Telephone: (530) 245-6300
	JENNIFER DENG, SBN 206285	E-mail: ljesrani@co.shasta.ca.us
17	Deputy District Attorney	J
	70 W. Hedding St, West Wing	Krishna A. Abrams
18	San Jose, CA 95110	District Attorney, County of Solano
19	Telephone: (408) 792-2818	DIANE NEWMAN, SBN 179926
19	E-mail: ydang@da.sccgov.org	Deputy District Attorney
20	jdeng@da.sccgov.org	675 Texas Street, 4 th Floor, #4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
20	JEFF ROSELL	Telephone: (707) 784-6903
21	District Attorney, County of Santa Cruz	E-mail: dmnewman@solanocounty.com
	Douglas Allen, SBN 99239	
22	Assistant District Attorney	JILL RAVITCH
22	701 Ocean Street, Suite 200	District Attorney, County of Sonoma
23	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	CAROLINE L. FOWLER, SBN 110313
24	Telephone: (831) 454-2930	Deputy District Attorney
24	E-mail: douglas.allen@santacruzcounty.us	MATTHEW CHEEVER, SBN 191783
25		Deputy District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212-J
		Santa Rosa, CA 95403
26		Telephone: (707) 565-2338
		E-mail: matthew.cheever@sonoma-county.org
27		caroline.fowler@sonoma-county.org
20		
28		
		2

Plaintiff, the People of the State of California, by and through Xavier Becerra, Attorney General of the State of California; Nancy E. O'Malley, District Attorney of Alameda County; Edward S. Berberian, District Attorney of Marin County; Dean Flippo, District Attorney of Monterey County; Allison Haley, District Attorney of Napa County; Tony Rackauckas, District Attorney of Orange County; Jeffrey F. Rosen, District Attorney of Santa Clara County; Jeffrey Rosell, District Attorney of Santa Cruz County; Stephanie Bridgett, District Attorney of Shasta County; Krishna Abrams, District Attorney of Solano County; and Jill R. Ravitch, District Attorney of Sonoma County hereby allege:

I. INTRODUCTION

- 1. This complaint seeks to remedy the Defendants' unfair business practices, false advertising, and failure to warn California consumers of the exposures to lead in toddler formula products that the Defendants sell, manufacture, and/or distribute for sale in the State of California. As discussed below, this complaint concerns two formulas: Sammy's Milk Free-Range Goat Milk Toddler Formula (Sammy's Milk), manufactured and sold by defendant Graceleigh, Inc., dba Sammy's Milk, and Peaceful Planet Toddler Supreme Formula (Peaceful Planet), manufactured and sold by defendant Nutraceutical Corporation. Hereafter in this complaint, Sammy's Milk and Peaceful Planet together will be referred to as the "Products."
- 2. The Products contain levels of lead that result in exposure above the Provisional Total Tolerable Intake Level for lead of six micrograms per day ("ug/day") set by the United States Food and Drug Administration, applicable to children six years and younger.
- 3. Each of the Products is adulterated within the meaning of the California Sherman Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Law ("Sherman Law"), because, due to high lead levels, each contains a "poisonous or deleterious substance that may render it injurious to health of man or any other animal that may consume it." (Health & Saf. Code, § 110545.) Consequently, neither of the Products may be manufactured or sold in California. (Health & Saf. Code, § 110620.) Sales of the Products in California therefore constitute unfair business practices that violate Business and Professions Code, section 17200.

- 4. Each of the Defendants has made false and misleading statements about their respective Products. Graceleigh Inc. claims that the ingredients in Sammy's Milk are "selected for purity" and refers to it as "clean nutrition." Nutraceutical Corporation claims that Peaceful Planet is "CLEAN!" and "PURE!" These claims by Defendants are false and/or misleading because both Products expose the toddler consuming them to alarmingly high concentrations of lead when used in a reasonably foreseeable manner. In making these claims about the Products, Defendants have violated the False Advertising Law (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 17500 et seq.), and the Sherman Law, (Health & Saf. Code, §§ 110390 and 110398), and these violations constitute unfair business practices that violate the Unfair Competition Law. (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 17200 et seq.)
- 5. Under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code, section 25249.6, or "Proposition 65," businesses must provide a "clear and reasonable warning" before exposing individuals to chemicals listed as known to the State of California to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity.
 - 6. Lead is known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.
 - 7. Toddlers who ingest the Products are exposed to lead.
- 8. No Defendant is providing clear and reasonable warnings regarding exposure to lead to toddlers from the Products. This constitutes a violation of Health and Safety Code, section 25249.6, which also is an unfair business practice that violates Business and Professions Code, section 17200.

II. PARTIES

9. Plaintiff is the People of the State of California, by and through the Attorney General of California, Xavier Becerra, and Nancy E. O'Malley, District Attorney of Alameda County; Edward S. Berberian, District Attorney of Marin County; Dean Flippo, District Attorney of Monterey County; Allison Haley, District Attorney of Napa County; Tony Rackauckas, District Attorney of Orange County; Jeffrey F. Rosen, District Attorney of Santa Clara County; Jeffrey Rosell, District Attorney of Santa Cruz County; Stephanie Bridgett, District Attorney of Shasta

County; Krishna Abrams, District Attorney of Solano County; and Jill R. Ravitch, District Attorney of Sonoma County (collectively referred to as "Plaintiff" or the "People").

- 10. The Attorney General and District Attorneys may bring actions to enforce Proposition 65 (Health & Saf. Code, § 25249.7, subd. (c)); and to prohibit unfair and unlawful business practices and false/misleading advertising (Bus. & Prof. Code, §§ 17200, 17204, 17206 and 17535 and 17536). The People bring this action under the authority granted to them by Proposition 65, the False Advertising Law, and the Unfair Competition Law.
- 11. Defendant Nutraceutical Corporation (hereafter "Nutraceutical") is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware, with its principal place of business in Park City, Utah. Plaintiff believes that evidence will show, after a reasonable opportunity for further investigation or discovery, that Nutraceutical employed ten or more persons during the applicable period of the statute of limitations. Nutraceutical is a "person in the course of doing business" within the meaning of Health and Safety Code, section 25249.11 (Proposition 65) and section 109995 (the Sherman Law). Nutraceutical is also "a person" within the meaning of Business and Professions Code, section 17201 (Unfair Competition Law) and section 17506 (False Advertising Law). Nutraceutical manufactures and/or sells the Peaceful Planet formula and has offered it for sale within California, even though the product is adulterated within the meaning of the Sherman Law, and without providing the clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65. Nutraceutical has made false and legally prohibited advertising claims with respect to the Peaceful Planet formula. Nutraceutical made these claims with the express purpose of promoting sales of the Peaceful Planet formula within California and inducing California consumers to purchase it.
- 12. Defendant Graceleigh, Inc., dba Sammy's Milk (hereafter "Graceleigh") is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of California, with its principal place of business in Newport Beach, California. Plaintiff believes that evidence will show, after a reasonable opportunity for further investigation or discovery, that Graceleigh employed ten or more persons during the applicable period of the statute of limitations. Graceleigh is a "person in

the course of doing business" within the meaning of Health and Safety Code, section 25249.11 (Proposition 65) and section 109995 (the Sherman Law). Graceleigh is also "a person" within the meaning of Business and Professions Code, section 17201 (Unfair Competition Law) and section 17506 (False Advertising Law). Graceleigh manufactures and/or sells the Sammy's Milk formula and has offered it for sale within California, even though the Product is adulterated within the meaning of the Sherman Law, and without the clear and reasonable warning required under Proposition 65. Graceleigh has made false and legally prohibited advertising claims with respect to the Sammy's Milk formula. Graceleigh made these claims with the express purpose of promoting sales of the Sammy's Milk formula within California and inducing California consumers to purchase it.

13. Defendant DOES 1-50, their agents, employees, officers, and others acting on their behalf, as well as subsidiaries, affiliates, and other entities controlled by DOES 1 through 50 (hereafter collectively referred to as "DOES 1 through 50") are business entities or persons engaged in the import, manufacture, sale, distribution and/or advertising of the Products. DOES 1 through 50 participated in some or all of the acts alleged herein, including that as part of their business activities, each of Does 1 through 50 has: (1) sold the Products that are adulterated with high levels of lead; (2) exposed consumers to lead without first providing the clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65; and/or (3) made false and misleading claims regarding the safety and health effects of the Products for the purpose of inducing California consumers to purchase them. The names and identities of defendants DOES 1 through 50 are unknown to the People, and when they are known this complaint will be amended to state their names and identities.

III. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 14. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to California Constitution, Article VI, section 10, because this case is a cause not given by statute to other trial courts.
- 15. This Court has jurisdiction over each Defendant named above, because each is a business entity that does sufficient business and/or has sufficient minimum contacts in California,

23. The clear and reasonable warning requirement of Proposition 65 is contained in Health and Safety Code, section 25249.6, which provides:

No Person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual, except as provided in Section 25249.10.

- 24. An exposure to a chemical in a consumer product is one "which results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption, or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service." (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25602, subd. (b).)
- 25. Proposition 65 establishes a procedure by which California is to develop a list of chemicals "known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity." (Health & Saf. Code, § 25249.8.)
- 26. Any person "violating or threatening to violate" the statute may be enjoined in any court of competent jurisdiction. (Health & Saf. Code, § 25249.7.) To "threaten to violate" means "to create a condition in which there is a substantial probability that a violation will occur." (*Id.*, § 25249.11, subd. (e).) In addition, violators are liable for civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation, recoverable in a civil action. (*Id.*, § 25249.7, subd. (b).)
- 27. Actions to enforce the law "may be brought by the Attorney General in the name of the People of the State of California, [or] by a district attorney" (*Id.*, § 25249.7, subd. (c).)

C. The False Advertising Law

- 28. Business and Professions Code, section 17500 provides that it is unlawful for any person, "with the intent directly or indirectly to dispose of real or personal property . . . to make or disseminate or cause to be made . . . any statement, concerning that real or personal property . . . which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading."
- 29. Section 17535 authorizes the Attorney General and District Attorneys to seek an injunction to prevent such untrue or misleading statements, and to provide restitution to the

victims of such statements. Section 17536 provides that any person violating section 17500 "shall be liable for a civil penalty not to exceed two thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500) for each violation, which shall be assessed and recovered in a civil action brought in the name of the people of the State of California by the Attorney General or by any district attorney. . . ." These civil penalties are cumulative to those obtained under Section 17200.

D. The Unfair Competition Law

- 30. California Business and Professions Code, section 17200 provides that "unfair competition shall mean and include unlawful, unfair or fraudulent business practice." Section 17203 of the Business and Professions Code provides that "(a)ny person performing or proposing to perform an act of unfair competition within this state may be enjoined in any court of competent jurisdiction."
- 31. Section 17206, subdivision (a) provides that any person violating Section 17200 "shall be liable for a civil penalty not to exceed two thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500) for each violation, which shall be assessed and recovered in a civil action brought in the name of the people of the State of California by the Attorney General or by any District Attorney." Under Section 17205, these penalties are "cumulative to each other and to the remedies or penalties available under all other laws of this state."

V. FACTS

- 32. Lead was placed on the list of chemicals known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm on February 27, 1987. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 27001, subd. (c).)
- 33. Lead was placed on the list of chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1992. (*Ibid.*)
- 34. Lead is a neurotoxin that bioaccumulates in humans. Recent studies have determined that lead can damage the human nervous system at lower exposure levels than previously believed. Children are among the most vulnerable to lead exposure. Children who are exposed

to lead may suffer from lowered IQs, behavioral issues, slowed body growth, hearing problems, kidney damage, and other serious health effects.

- 35. The United States Food and Drug Administration has set Provisional Total Tolerable Intake Levels for lead, which represent the maximum tolerable daily lead intake to which a person should be exposed from all sources. The Provisional Total Tolerable Intake Level is 6 micrograms of lead per day for children 6 or younger.
- 36. Consumption of each of the Products results in exposures to lead above the Provisional Total Tolerable Intake Levels for children 6 or younger and the Products are therefore adulterated pursuant to the Sherman Law.
- 37. The Graceleigh product Sammy's Milk has caused and continues to cause exposures to lead.
- 38. The Nutraceutical product Peaceful Planet is labelled on the front of the container as "formula."
- 39. The Nutraceutical product Peaceful Planet has caused and continues to cause exposures to lead.
- 40. At all times material to this complaint, Graceleigh has falsely advertised and made other misrepresentations to California consumers regarding Sammy's Milk. Among other things, it advertised on its website that: the ingredients of Sammy's Milk were "selected for purity" and that the Sammy's Milk is "clean nutrition."
- 41. At all times material to this complaint, Nutraceutical has falsely advertised and made other misrepresentations to California consumers regarding Peaceful Planet. Among other things, it advertised on the product labelling that Peaceful Planet is "CLEAN!" and "PURE!"
- 42. At all times material to this complaint, Defendants, and each of them, knew their respective Products contained lead.
- 43. Notwithstanding this knowledge, all Defendants—at all times material to this complaint—advertised, manufactured, marketed, distributed, and/or sold the Products in

- Violating the Sherman Law (Health and Safety Code, § 110390) by disseminating false and/or misleading advertisements that accompany the Products when sold to California consumers.
- Violating the Sherman Law (Health and Safety Code, §110395) by
 manufacturing and/or selling the Products, which are falsely advertised.
- Violating the Sherman Law (Health and Safety Code, § 110398) by advertising the Products to California consumers when the Products are adulterated under the definition of Health and Safety Code, section 110545.
- 53. By committing the acts alleged above, Defendants are liable to the People for civil penalties of up to \$2,500 for each violation.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, the People respectfully request that the Court:

- 1. Order civil penalties against each Defendant according to proof, pursuant to all causes of action;
- 2. Permanently enjoin Defendants, their agents, employees, and all other persons or entities, corporate or otherwise, in active concert or participation with any of them, from making any untrue or misleading statements in violation of Business and Professions Code, section 17500, including, but not limited to, the untrue or misleading statements alleged in this complaint, under the authority of Business and Professions Code, section 17535;
- 3. Permanently enjoin Defendants, their agents, employees, and all other persons or entities, corporate or otherwise, in active concert or participation with any of them, from engaging in unfair competition as defined in Business and Professions Code, section 17200, including, but not limited to, the acts and practices alleged in this complaint, under the authority of Business and Professions Code, section 17203;
- 4. Permanently enjoin Defendants, their agents, employees, and all other persons or entities, corporate or otherwise, in active concert or participation with any of them, from violating

Health and Safety Code, section 25249.6, by exposing persons within the State of California to lead caused by the ingestion of their Products, without providing clear and reasonable warning;

- 5. Make such orders or judgments as may be necessary, including preliminary injunctive and ancillary relief, to prevent the use or employment by any Defendant, its agents, employees, and all other persons or entities, corporate or otherwise, in active concert or participation with any of them, of any practice that violates Business and Professions Code, section 17500, or that may be necessary to restore to any person in interest any money or property, real or personal, which may have been acquired by means of any such practice, under the authority of Business and Professions Code, section 17535 and any other applicable laws;
- 6. Make such orders or judgments as may be necessary, including preliminary injunctive and ancillary relief, to prevent the use or employment by any Defendant, its agents, employees, and all other persons or entities, corporate or otherwise, in active concert or participation with any of them, of any practice that constitutes unfair competition or as may be necessary to restore to any person in interest any money or property, real or personal, which may have been acquired by means of any such practice, under the authority of Business and Professions Code, section 17203 and any other applicable laws;
 - 7. Award the People costs of suit, including costs of investigation;
 - 8. Grant such other and further relief as the court deems just and proper.

Dated: June 7, 2018

Respectfully Submitted,

XAVIER BECERRA
Attorney General of California
SUSAN S. FIERING
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
DENNIS A. RAGEN
Deputy Attorney General

Megan K. Hey

Deputy Attorney General

Attorneys for the People of the State of California ex rel. Xavier Becerra, Attorney

General

1	TONY RACKAUCKAS	EDWARD S. BERBERIAN
	District Attorney, County of Orange	District Attorney, County of Marin
2	Tracy E. Hughes, SBN 180484	Andres Perez, SBN 186219
3	Senior Deputy District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive	Deputy District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 145
	Santa Ana, CA 92701	San Rafael, CA 94903
4	(714) 834-6504	Telephone: (415) 473-3072
5	Nancy E. O'Malley	E-mail: aperez@marincounty.org
3	District Attorney, County of Alameda	ALLISION HALEY
6	MATTHEW L. BELTRAMO, SBN 184796	District Attorney, County of Napa
7	Deputy District Attorney	KATY YOUNT SBN 279550
7	SHARA BELTRAMO, SBN 227246	Deputy District Attorney PATRICK COLLINS, SBN 253872
8	Deputy District Attorney 1225 Fallon St., 9th Floor	Deputy District Attorney
	Oakland, CA 94612	1127 First Street, Suite C
9	Telephone: 510-383-8600	Napa, CA 94559
10	E-mail: matt.beltramo@acgov.org	Telephone: (707) 299-1452 E-mail: katy.yount@countyofnapa.org
10	shara.beltramo@acgov.org	patrick.collins@countyofnapa.org
11	DEAN D. FLIPPO	
12	District Attorney, County of Monterey	STEPHANIE BRIDGET
12	AMY ANDERSON, SBN 301732 Deputy District Attorney	District Attorney, County of Shasta ANAND "LUCKY" JESRANI, SBN 238252
13	CHRISTOPHER JUDGE, SBN 274418	Senior Deputy District Attorney
1.4	Deputy District Attorney	1355 West Street
14	1200 Aguajito Road, Room 301,	Redding, CA 96001
15	Monterey, CA 93940 Telephone: (831) 647-7770	Telephone: (530) 245-6300 E-mail: ljesrani@co.shasta.ca.us
	E-mail: andersona@co.monterey.ca.us	
16	judgec@co.monterey.ca.us	Krishna A. Abrams
17	JEFFREY ROSEN	District Attorney, County of Solano DIANE NEWMAN, SBN 179926
-,	District Attorney, County of Santa Clara	Deputy District Attorney
18	YEN DANG, SBN 169388	675 Texas Street, 4 th Floor, #4500
19	Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Fairfield, CA 94533
1)	JENNIFER DENG, SBN 206285 Deputy District Attorney	Telephone: (707) 784-6903 E-mail: dmnewman@solanocounty.com
20	70 W. Hedding St, West Wing	2 main annie winan e sommocouncy com
21	San Jose, CA 95110	JILL RAVITCH
21	Telephone: (408) 792-2818 E-mail: ydang@da.sccgov.org	District Attorney, County of Sonoma CAROLINE L. FOWLER, SBN 110313
22	jdeng@da.sccgov.org	Deputy District Attorney
2.0		MATTHEW CHEEVER, SBN 191783
23	JEFF ROSELL District Attorney County of Sente Cruz	Deputy District Attorney
24	District Attorney, County of Santa Cruz DOUGLAS ALLEN, SBN 99239	600 Administration Drive, Room 212-J Santa Rosa, CA 95403
	Assistant District Attorney	Telephone: (707) 565-2338
25	701 Ocean Street, Suite 200	E-mail: matthew.cheever@sonoma-county.org
26	Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Telephone: (831) 454-2930	caroline.fowler@sonoma-county.org
20	E-mail: douglas.allen@santacruzcounty.us	
27		
28	LA2017950063	
20	62851058.doc	15
		15